

**MINUTES OF THE  
BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS  
OF THE  
CLEVELAND METROPOLITAN PARK DISTRICT**

**OCTOBER 13, 2016**

The Board of Park Commissioners met on this date, Thursday, October 13, 2016, 7:30 a.m., at the Board's office, 4101 Fulton Parkway, Cleveland, Ohio.

The roll call showed President Debra K. Berry, Vice President Dan T. Moore, and Vice President Bruce G. Rinker, to be present. It was determined there was a quorum. Chief Executive Officer, Brian M. Zimmerman, Chief Financial Officer, Karen Fegan, and Chief Legal and Ethics Officer, Rosalina M. Fini, were also in attendance.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION.**

**No. 16-10-162:** At 7:31 a.m., upon motion by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, the meeting adjourned to an Executive Session for the purpose of discussing a Personnel (Employment) Matter, as stated by Chief Legal and Ethics Officer, Rose Fini.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Aye: Ms. Berry  
Aye: Mr. Rinker  
Aye: Mr. Moore  
Nays: None.

**No action was taken as a result of the Executive Session.**

**MEETING RECONVENED.**

At 8: 27 a.m., the regular meeting reconvened.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES.**

**No. 16-10-163:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to approve the minutes from the Regular Meeting of September 26, 2016, which were previously submitted to the members of the Board, and by them read.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.

Nays: None.

**ACTION ITEMS.**

- (a) ***Change Order No. 1: Bid No. 6215 - 2016 Asphalt Pavement Improvements***  
(Originating Sources: Joseph V. Roszak, Chief Operating Officer/Jim Rodstrom, Director of Construction)

**Background**

On September 8, 2016 the Board awarded Karvo Paving Company a contract in the amount of \$860,746.26 for asphalt pavement improvements to 5.50 miles of parkway in North Chagrin, Big Creek, Brecksville, and Mill Stream Run Reservations. Utilizing funding allocated within the budget, an additional section of parkway has been identified on Hogsback Lane in Rocky River Reservation for asphalt pavement improvements.

**Contract and Change Order Summary**

Original Bid Awarded September 8, 2016	Contract Amount \$860,746.26
<b>Request for Change Order No. 1</b>	
<b><u>Hogsback Lane, Rocky River Reservation:</u></b> 1" leveling course and a 1-1/2" asphalt surface course overlay of approximately 0.40 miles (4,610 square yards) of roadway on Hogsback Lane between Riverside Drive and Valley Parkway in Rocky River Reservation. Roadway striping, loop detectors, and berming included after the asphalt overlay.	\$61,792.10
<b>Total, Change Order #1</b>	
<b>\$61,792.10</b>	
<b>Total Revised Contract Including Change Order No. 1</b>	
<b>\$922,538.36</b>	

The unit cost for this change order work computes to \$13.40 per square yard of pavement leveled and paved. These unit costs are comparable to the historic unit costs for similar paving work seen over the past few years.

2016 Budget Code: 1510-73462-A11002

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)**

**No. 16-10-164:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to approve Change Order No. 1 with Karvo Paving Company in the amount of \$61,792.10 as described above resulting in a revised, total contract amount of \$922,538.36; further, that the Board authorize the Chief Executive Officer to execute Change Order No. 1.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.

Nays: None.

**(b) *Bid #5975 Modification: Printing & Mailing Services***  
(Originating Source: Ronald D. Ciancutti, Director of Procurement)

At the Board meeting of November 12, 2015 the Board approved the bid extension of Penton Marketing at the cost of \$103,548.07 for printing and mailing services for the 2016 *Emerald Necklace* newsletter.

The quantity of *Emerald Necklace* newsletters printed had increased in 2015 and this increase was not accurately reflected in the 2016 bid renewal.

In light of this the Board is hereby asked to approve an increase of \$13,000 to the award amount to accommodate the difference.

ORIGINAL AWARD:	\$103,548.07
Additional printing estimate:	<u>13,000.00</u>
REVISED TOTAL AWARD	\$116,548.07

Consequently, an increase in the total amount, as shown above, is recommended for approval by the Board at this time to complete final invoices for the 2016 publications.

**No. 16-10-165:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to authorize the increase of the *Emerald Necklace* printing and mailing services originally approved on November 12, 2015, for a revised total estimate not to exceed \$116,548.07.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.

Nays: None.

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)**

- (c) **2017 Cleveland Metroparks Employee Group Health Care Benefits**  
(Originating Sources: Brian M. Zimmerman, Chief Executive Officer/Harold Harrison, Chief Human Resources Officer/Karen Fegan, Chief Financial Officer)

**A. 2017 MEDICAL BENEFITS****1) Self-Insured Preferred Provider Organization (“PPO”) Plans**

Since January 1, 2007, the Park District has offered a self-insured medical plan which includes an administrative services only (“ASO”) provider network and claims adjudication services and stop-loss insurance coverage. The Park District currently offers three plan design options (High Premium-Plan A, Mid Premium-Plan B, and High Deductible/Health Savings Account - Plan C).

**Administrative Service Only Agreement – Cigna**

In 2016 the Park District entered into a three-year agreement with Cigna to provide access to their provider network (including discounts) and claims adjudication service for the self-insured medical plans. This contract requires a base administrative fee of \$32.37 per employee per month (“PEPM”). The contract includes an increase of \$2.00 PEPM to the administrative fee in 2017 for implementation of the Cigna outpatient care management program. The contract also contains an option to provide additional wellness programming beginning in 2017 at a cost of \$1.95 PEPM. Accordingly, the Cigna ASO contract will have a maximum premium rate of \$36.32 PEPM for 2017.

**Stop-Loss Insurance**

Stop-loss insurance provides the Park District with individual claim caps (currently \$125,000 per individual) and aggregate claim caps (125% of expected claims for the Park District). HR and Oswald solicited proposals (RFP #6226) for one-year of stop-loss insurance coverage and received timely responses from two providers, Cigna and Reliance Standard. Cigna has proposed a 21% premium increase (approximately \$835,076 total premium in 2017) for 2017. Cigna additionally proposed a flat rate increase (approximately \$659,732 total premium in 2017) provided the Park District increase its deductible to \$150,000.

Based on this review, HR and Oswald recommend acceptance of Cigna’s proposal at the \$150,000 deductible level (\$98.35 PEPM for specific coverage and \$4.72 PEPM for aggregate coverage).

Cigna has set the annual maximum claims amount for 2017 at \$15,479.76 per employee per year (approximately \$8,653,186 in maximum liability).

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)****Self-Insured Plan Designs and 2017 Premiums**

HR and Oswald are recommending the following plan design changes for the A-Plan and B-Plan to enhance cost containment in 2017:

	Current	Proposed
A-Plan Single Deductible	\$300	\$500
A-Plan Family Deductible	\$600	\$1,000
A-Plan Single Annual Maximum	\$1,500	\$2,000
A-Plan Family Annual Maximum	\$3,000	\$4,000
B-Plan Single Deductible	\$750	\$1,000
B-Plan Family Deductible	\$1,000	\$2,000
Specialty Pharmacy Co-Pay	\$50	\$100

The following is a summary of the monthly premium rates for 2017 under the revised plan designs:

<i>Cigna Open Access Plus Plan</i>	<b>A-Plan</b>	<b>B-Plan</b>	<b>C-Plan</b>
<b>Single</b>	\$668.26	\$598.30	\$519.04
<b>Family</b>	\$1,587.26	\$1,405.79	\$1,232.82

Unless otherwise modified by a collective bargaining agreement, employee contribution rates for each plan will be determined by the Chief Executive Officer.

**2) Wellness Incentive Program**

Since 2013, Cleveland Metroparks has offered a wellness incentive program to encourage and reward health behaviors/actions of employees, spouses or same-sex domestic partners, and dependents. Pursuant to the program, monthly employee premium contributions were reduced by credits for obtaining certain requirements, including preventive care certifications, non-tobacco affidavits, health risk assessments and registration for telehealth programs. Based on the success of the program, HR will continue to offer wellness incentive premium credits at the same level as 2016 (\$45/month for single and \$70/month for families).

**3) Medical Buyout**

The “buyout” option is a cash payment to employees, who would otherwise be eligible for family medical coverage, who decline to elect medical benefits from the Park District and utilize their spouse’s employer’s health plan. Annual verification documentation is required. HR and Oswald are recommending continuing the buyout rate at \$150.00 per month in 2017.

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)****B. 2017 DENTAL AND VISION BENEFITS****1) Dental Benefits**

In July 2015, HR and Oswald released Request for Proposal #6109, requesting proposals for a new fully-insured dental agreement. Six providers, Aetna (incumbent), Cigna, Delta Dental, Liberty Dental, MetLife Dental and Ameritas, provided timely responses to RFP #6109.

Aetna's proposal included a renewal of current services at a 7% premium reduction, with a 3% increase cap in year two. The Board approved the renewal agreement with Aetna for 2016 with the one-year renewal option with a maximum 3% premium increase cap. HR and Oswald are recommending exercising this renewal option with a 3% increase for 2017.

The following are the proposed 2017 rates with Aetna:

	<b>Dental PPO</b>	<b>Dental DMO</b>
<b>Single</b>	\$22.81	\$22.81
<b>Family</b>	\$75.63	\$75.63

Unless otherwise modified by a collective bargaining agreement, employee contribution rates for the dental plan will be determined by the Chief Executive Officer.

**2) Vision Benefits**

In 2013, Cleveland Metroparks entered into a contract with Aetna for vision coverage in 2014. This contract included a flat renewal rate guarantee through 2017. Accordingly, HR and Oswald recommend that the Park District exercise the final flat-rate renewal option with Aetna to provide fully-insured vision coverage at the below rates:

	<b>Vision</b>
<b>Single</b>	\$ 3.89
<b>Family</b>	\$11.81

Unless otherwise modified by a collective bargaining agreement, employer contribution rates for the vision plan will be determined by the Chief Executive Officer.

**No. 16-10-166:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to approve the 2017 Cleveland Metroparks Employee Group Health Care Benefits as follows:

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)****A. Self-Insurance Plan**

- a. That the Board approve the continuation by the Chief Executive Officer of the self-insured employee health benefits program, maintained pursuant to Section 9.833 of the Ohio Revised Code, to pay for authorized health care benefits, including health care and prescription drugs, under the Cigna PPO plan options and rates described above (the “Self-Insured Program”) for the 2017 plan year.
- b. That the Board direct the Chief Executive Officer to take all necessary actions to reserve funds, as are necessary, in the exercise of sound and prudent actuarial judgment, to cover potential costs of health care benefits for the Self-Insured Program. The funds shall be reserved in a special fund (the “Self-Insurance Fund”) established pursuant to this resolution, which shall comply with the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Section 9.833. The costs of the Self-Insured Program, including, but not limited to, claims paid, administrative fees, consultant fees, wellness programs, telehealth services, and legal fees, may be allocated to the Self-Insurance Fund on the basis of relative exposure and loss experience.
- c. That the Board direct the Chief Executive Officer to have a report prepared and published of amounts reserved and disbursements made from the Self-Insurance Fund, which comports with and conforms to the requirements of Ohio Revised Code Section 9.833, and is maintained and made available for inspection at all reasonable times during regular business hours at the Cleveland Metroparks Administrative Office.
- d. That the Board authorize the Chief Executive Officer to offer the health care “buyout” option at the rate of \$150 per month.

**B. Stop-Loss / Reinsurance Coverage (RFP #6128)**

That the Board approve an award on RFP #6226 and authorize the Chief Executive Officer to enter into a one-year agreement, in a form approved by Counsel, with Cigna at the rates cited above to purchase stop-loss reinsurance for \$150,000 deductible specific stop-loss insurance and aggregate stop-loss insurance at 125% of expected claims as projected by Cigna. The agreement shall commence on January 1, 2017 and cover claims incurred in the twelve (12) month period covering the Self-Insured Program’s year beginning January 1, 2017, but paid on or before December 31, 2018.

**ACTION ITEMS (cont.)**

**C. Dental Benefits**

That the Board authorize the Chief Executive Officer to exercise a renewal agreement, in a form approved by Counsel, with Aetna at the rates cited above to purchase fully-insured dental coverage from January 1, 2017 through December 31, 2018.

**D. Vision Benefits**

That the Board authorize the Chief Executive Officer to exercise a renewal agreement, in a form approved by Counsel, with Aetna at the rates cited above to purchase fully-insured vision coverage from January 1, 2017 through December 31, 2018.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.

Nays: None.



**AWARD OF BIDS:**

**No. 16-10-167:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to authorize the following bid awards:

- (a) **NCPA Co-Op #6045:** Various Office Supplies and Services (see page **82438**);
- (b) **Bid #6223:** Printing and Mailing Services (see page **82439**);
- (c) **Co-Op #6228:** Four (4) New Toro Reelmaster 3555-D Fairway Mowers (see page **82441**); and
- (d) **National IPA Co-Op #6229:** Various Lamps (including LED's) and Ballasts (see page **82442**).

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.  
Nays: None.

**AWARD OF BIDS (cont.):****NCPA CO-OP #6045 RENEWAL SUMMARY:**

**VARIOUS OFFICE SUPPLIES AND SERVICES** for various locations throughout Cleveland Metroparks to be supplied on an “as needed” basis beginning January 1, 2015 through December 31, 2016, with an option to renew for an additional two (2) year period.

**Background**

Independence Business Supply is the current supplier of office supplies throughout Cleveland Metroparks. Park staff utilizes a web-based electronic catalog concept for procurement of such supplies with a net-priced catalog custom-tailored for Cleveland Metroparks which is protected by a user name and password for an online security system. Independence Business Supply provides Just-In-Time/next day (24-hour) delivery for all items to various locations throughout Cleveland Metroparks. The contract term was originally for a two (2) year period beginning January 1, 2015 through December 31, 2016. This action exercises the option to renew for an additional two (2) year period through December 31, 2018.

Independence Business Supply leveraged the National Cooperative Purchasing Alliance (NCPA) contract number NCPA11-01 to provide the best overall value. To validate Co-Op savings, staff compared the overall pricing structure and value added (online services, sustainability program, rebates) offered by Independence Business Supply to the State of Ohio Contract (through Staples Inc.) and W.B. Mason Co. (not on a cooperative agreement).

The Procurement Director recommends Independence Business Supply as the supplier of office supplies to Cleveland Metroparks for an additional two (2) year period beginning January 1, 2017 through December 31, 2018.

The contract with Independence Business Supply serves as an active contract to evaluate the cost of office supplies monthly which ensures Cleveland Metroparks is getting the optimal cost.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

That the Board authorize the purchase of various office supplies and services, as specified in the above summary for NCPA Co-Op Renewal #6045 to **Independence Business Supply (IBS)** to be purchased on an “as needed” basis for a two (2) year period, beginning January 1, 2017 through December 31, 2018, **for a total cost not to exceed \$225,000**, in full utilization of the National Cooperative Purchasing Alliance (NCPA) contract number NCPA11-01; equivalency affidavit ORC 125.04.

**(See Approval of this Item by Resolution No. 16-10-167 on Page 82437)**

**AWARD OF BIDS (cont.):**

**BID #6223:** **PRINTING and MAILING SERVICES\*** of Cleveland Metroparks monthly *Emerald Necklace* Newsletter for a 12 month period, beginning with January 2017 issue and ending December 2017 issue (with an option to renew for an additional one (1) year period)

<b>---- HIGHLIGHTS AT A GLANCE ----</b>
2016 Estimated Expenditures (12 months) = \$126,748.07
2017 Estimate (12 months) = \$77,834.92

**History**

The *Emerald Necklace* is a monthly newsletter that provides the general public with information on Cleveland Metroparks educational and recreational opportunities. The newsletter has been published for over 65 years and has undergone many changes. Currently, 27,000 households receive the *Emerald Necklace*; an additional 13,000 are distributed to nature centers and community centers on a monthly basis.

Since 2010, Internet media consumption has increased over 100%, while magazines have declined 23%\*\*. Therefore, a research study was conducted with *Emerald Necklace* readers in summer of 2016. Respondents indicated they most frequently read the event/program/activity information (71%), nearly two times more than any other section (feature articles, Naturalist’s Almanac). Based on this feedback, Cleveland Metroparks will produce a full color, 12-page monthly event/program/activity calendar. Quarterly, the publication will also include feature articles and content specific to each season. Printing and mailing services will be performed by a third party vendor, including increased responsibilities to more efficiently and effectively manage the *Emerald Necklace* database and distribution. Design services will now be handled by the Visual Communications team within Cleveland Metroparks Marketing Department. All of these efforts have combined to reduce costs substantially in 2017 (almost \$49,000 less than 2016).

**Recommendation**

Cleveland Metroparks sourced to 365 vendors for the printing and mail services of the *Emerald Necklace* newsletter and received two (2) responsive bids; RR Donnelley and Midwest Direct. RR Donnelley presented the lowest and best bid for the printing and mailing services. Cleveland Metroparks recommends an award of the *Emerald Necklace* newsletter to RR Donnelley for the printing and mailing services. Full bid results can be found on file in the Office of Procurement.

Bid comparisons for 2016 and 2017 issues

<b>2017 Issues – Bid #6223 in 4 Color</b>	<b>2016 Issues – Bid #5975 in 4 Color</b>
Printing - \$61,992.00	Printing - \$112,068.07
Mailing - \$14,842.92	Mailing - \$3,480
Design – n/a	Design - \$10,200
Author’s Alterations - \$1,000.00	Author’s Alterations - \$1,000
<b>Total - \$77,834.92</b>	<b>Total - \$126,748.07</b>

**AWARD OF BIDS (cont.):**

The mailing cost for the 2017 issues is based on a monthly charge that includes shipping cost (at the vendor's expense) to the Post Office and labeling, bundling, and sorting. However, the cost does not include postage. Postage is a separate cost through United Parcel Services (UPS) and Cleveland Metroparks Business Reply Account through the United States Postal Services (USPS).

*\*Mail services include: list management, bulk mail packaging, and delivery to USPS and Cleveland Metroparks; postage not included*

*\*\*Source: ZenithOptimedia reported on Fortune.com*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

That the Board authorize an award to the lowest and best bidder for Bid #6223 to **RR Donnelley**, for printing and mailing services for a 12-month period, beginning with the January 2017 issue and ending with the December 2017 issue for a 24-page issue four times a year and a 12-page issue eight times a year at a cost of \$61,992.00, *including author's alteration allowance not to exceed \$1,000 plus \$14,842.92 in mailing services:* \$859.79.00/month for individual imprinted addressed and \$235.70/month for bundled in various quantities), **for a total combined cost not to exceed \$77,834.92**, with an option to extend for an additional one-year period. In the event the log of consumption approaches 90 percent of the total estimate an action item will presented to the Board requesting an increase to the expenditure. In the event this vendor cannot satisfy the bid, the award will be given to the next bidder who the Board, in its discretion, has reflected in the minutes as being the next lowest and best bidder who can satisfy the bid. The difference in cost and all related costs to the difference will be assumed by the original bidder and/or surety.

**(See Approval of this Item by Resolution No. 16-10-167 on Page 82437)**

**AWARD OF BIDS (cont.):****OHIO CO-OP #6228 SUMMARY: FOUR (4) NEW TORO REELMASTER 3555-D FAIRWAY MOWERS** for Cleveland Metroparks Golf Courses

<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Toro Reelmaster 3555-D 24.8hp tier 4-comp diesel engine</li> <li>• 22"x5" 11 blade forward swept reel edge series deck</li> <li>• Weight for cutting unit</li> <li>• Wiehle roller scraper and rear roller scraper kit (22")</li> <li>• Three (3) year comprehensive warranty</li> </ul>
<b>DESIGNATION</b>	Two (2) for Manakiki GC (3304-74714 \$86,776.16)  Two (2) for Sleepy Hollow GC (3305-74714 \$86,776.16)
<b>UNIT(S) REPLACED including year, mileage and condition</b>	4 mowers (all are 1998 models) 6,400 to 6,900 engine hours All existing units are in worn, poor condition
<b>UNIT</b>	\$43,388.08 each
<b>TOTAL ORDER (x4)</b>	<b>\$173,552.32</b>

*The replaced units will go to on-line auction or replace units of lesser value that will go to on-line auction.*

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

That the Board approve the purchase of four (4) New Toro Reelmaster 3555-D Fairway Mowers, equipped as specified in the above summary, from **Century Equipment for a total cost of \$173,552.32** in full utilization of the Ohio Cooperative Purchasing Program, Contract Number 800261; equivalency affidavit ORC 125.04.

**(See Approval of this Item by Resolution No. 16-10-167 on Page 82437)**

**AWARD OF BIDS (cont.):****NATIONAL IPA CO-OP #6229 SUMMARY:**

**VARIOUS LAMPS (INCLUDING LED'S) AND BALLASTS** for various locations throughout Cleveland Metroparks to be supplied on an "as needed" basis beginning November 22, 2016 through November 21, 2018, with an option to renew for an additional one (1) year period.

**Background**

Wesco Distribution is the current supplier of lamps (including LED's) and ballasts throughout Cleveland Metroparks. Staff utilizes a web-based electronic catalog concept for procurement of such products with a net-priced catalog custom-tailored for Cleveland Metroparks which is protected by a user name and password for online security system. Wesco Distribution provides Just-In-Time/next day (24-hour) delivery for all items to various locations throughout Cleveland Metroparks.

Wesco Distribution leveraged the National IPA contract number R142106 to provide the best overall value. Staff compared the overall pricing structure and value added (online services, sustainability program, rebates) offered by Wesco Distribution to the US Communities Government Purchasing Alliance Contract (through Graybar) and Leff Electric (not on a cooperative agreement).

The Procurement Director recommends Wesco Distribution as the supplier of lamps (including LED's) and ballasts to various locations throughout the park for a two (2) year period beginning November 22, 2016 through November 21, 2018, with an option to renew for an additional one (1) year period.

The contract with Wesco Distribution serves as an active contract to evaluate the cost of products monthly which ensures Cleveland Metroparks is getting the optimal cost.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

That the Board authorize the purchase of various lamps and ballasts, as specified in the above summary for National IPA Co-Op and ORC 125.04 #6045 to **Wesco Distribution** to be purchased on an "as needed" basis for a two (2) year period, beginning November 22, 2016 through November 21, 2018, with an option to renew for one (1) additional year, **for an initial two (2) year cost not to exceed \$100,000**, in full utilization of the National IPA contract number R142106; equivalency affidavit ORC 125.04.

**(See Approval of this Item by Resolution No. 16-10-167 on Page 82437)**

**SERVICES (\$10,000 - \$50,000) ACQUIRED**  
**SINCE LAST BOARD MEETING (Presented 10/13/16)**

Cleveland Metroparks By-Laws, Article 5 (Procurement), Section 4 (a), as revised and approved by the Board of Park Commissioners on January 10, 2013, *"The CEO is authorized to enter into contracts and contract amendments for construction, change orders, and to purchase equipment, goods and services, and real estate, without prior approval of the Board in each instance, if the cost of the contract or contract amendment, for any single project, or the amount of the purchase, does not exceed \$50,000. Any contracts where the cost exceeds \$10,000 or any purchase where the amount exceeds \$10,000, and approved by the CEO, shall be reported to the Board at its next regularly scheduled meeting following the execution of said contract or said purchase,"* the following is provided:

<b><u>REF. NO. / ITEM – SERVICE</u></b>	<b><u>VENDOR</u></b>	<b><u>COST</u></b>	<b><u>PROCEDURE</u></b>
Aluminum caging for the Africa dry barn including measure-trip, fabrication delivery and installation.	<b>Corners Limited</b>	<b>\$29,500.00</b>	<b>(3)</b>
Road grinding mill 12” and haul away asphalt/stone base at Strawberry Lane.	<b>Chagrin Valley Paving</b>	<b>\$42,300.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Renewal of Symantec Essentials Support: Antivirus Protection Suite.	<b>CDW Government, Inc.</b>	<b>\$13,606.50</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Production of spring/winter pole banners, replacing “Come out and Play” theme with Centennial theme.	<b>Repros Inc.</b>	<b>\$10,560.00</b> <b><u>5,521.60</u></b> <b>\$16,081.60</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Labor, materials and equipment to perform and complete the Wendy Park <u>window replacement</u> and repair at the Coast Guard Station.	<b>RW Clark Co., Inc.</b>	<b>\$26,388.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Labor, materials and equipment to perform and complete the Wendy Park <u>garage door replacement</u> and repair at the Coast Guard Station.	<b>Columbia Overhead Door</b>	<b>\$16,770.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Labor , materials and equipment to perform and complete the Wendy Park <u>garage roof replacement</u> and repair at the Coast Guard Station.	<b>RW Clark Co., Inc.</b>	<b>\$37,950.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>

**SERVICES (\$10,000 - \$50,000) ACQUIRED (cont.)**

<b><u>REF. NO. / ITEM – SERVICE</u></b>	<b><u>VENDOR</u></b>	<b><u>COST</u></b>	<b><u>PROCEDURE</u></b>
Sound, stage and lighting for 2016 Boo at the Zoo event.	<b>Vertical Sound</b>	<b>\$38,525.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Estimate for 2015 financial statement audit.	<b>Ohio, Treasurer of State Auditor of State</b>	<b>\$30,000.00</b>	<b>(3)</b>
Mason sand for additional locations beyond original designated list.	<b>Tri-County Concrete, inc.</b>	<b>\$ 9,490.00</b> <b><u>2,248.28</u></b> <b>\$11,738.28</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Wire to fuel pump and other connections at Perkins Stables, Lakefront Reservation.	<b>Scott Electrical Service</b>	<b>\$25,395.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Installation of two standing seam metal roofs at Euclid and Wildwood shelters.	<b>C &amp; C Roofing</b>	<b>\$16,350.00</b>	
Installation of two new fuels pumps at Perkins Stables at Edgewater Park, Lakefront Reservation.	<b>Collins Equipments</b>	<b>\$19,988.00</b>	<b>(2)</b>
DR expansion 27TB license for additional back up storage as regards disaster recovery.	<b>DELL</b>	<b>\$26,505.00</b>	<b>(2)</b>
Replacement of various playground equipment at Ohio and Erie Canal.	<b>David Williams and Associates</b>	<b>\$13,682.05</b>	<b>(3)</b>
Adds funds for promotional assessments for 2016.	<b>P R A D C O</b>	<b>\$36,080.00</b> <b><u>3,400.00</u></b> <b>\$39,480.00</b>	<b>(3)</b>
Additional demolition material (for footing) beyond original estimate at Stinchcomb Memorial.	<b>Kurtz Brothers</b>	<b>\$ 7,000.00</b> <b><u>5,000.00</u></b> <b>\$12,000.00</b>	<b>(6)</b>
Generator rental for PCA Building at zoo due to transformer failure – originally shown on “S” list under \$10,000 – shown here to accommodate additional day of rental beyond estimate.	<b>Sunbelt Rentals</b>	<b>\$10,000.00</b> <b><u>2,072.86</u></b> <b>\$12,072.86</b>	<b>(7)</b>



**SERVICES (\$10,000 - \$50,000) ACQUIRED (cont.)**

<b><u>REF. NO. / ITEM – SERVICE</u></b>	<b><u>VENDOR</u></b>	<b><u>COST</u></b>	<b><u>PROCEDURE</u></b>
Various food fish supplied for a one year period including herring, smelt, mackerel, capelin, etc. through August 31, 2017.	<b>Atlantic/Pacific</b>	<b>\$26,802.40</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Weekly clean up service (May thru October) for lower Edgewater Parking Lot and monthly service at Perkins Lot from 2017 through 2019.	<b>Southwest Sweeping</b>	<b>\$44,112.00</b>	<b>(7)</b>
Propane Gas - bulk and cylinder at various locations beginning November 1, 2016 and ending October 31, 2017.	<b>Amerigas Propane</b>	<b>\$25,000.00</b>	<b>(2)</b>
Employee Assistance Program for a two year period beginning August 1, 2016 and ending July 31, 2018	<b>The Centers for Families and Children</b>	<b>\$35,712.00</b>	<b>(3)</b>
Wireless communication services for a two year period beginning October 1, 2016 for Rangers.	<b>AT&amp;T Mobility</b>	<b>\$39,211.71</b>	<b>(2)</b>

===== **KEY TO TERMS** =====

- (1) "**BID**" – Formal bid invitations sent and advertised in *The Plain Dealer* 15 days preceding the bid opening.
- (2) "**COOPERATIVE**" – Purchased through cooperative purchasing programs i.e. – State of Ohio, US Communities, etc.
- (3) "**SOLE SOURCE**" – Purchased from one source as competitive alternatives are not available.
- (4) "**PROPRIETARY**" – Merchandise purchased for resale directly from the brand’s manufacturer.
- (5) "**PROFESSIONAL SERVICE**" – Services of an accountant, architect, attorney at law, physician, professional engineer, construction project manager, consultant, surveyor or appraiser as outlined under Article 5, Sections 1-4 of the Board By Laws and defined by ORC 307.86.
- (6) "**COMPETITIVE QUOTE (up to \$10,000)**" – Originally estimated \$10,000 or less, quoted by three vendors.
- (7) "**COMPETITIVE QUOTE (over \$10,000 to \$50,000)**" – Chosen through the accumulation of three written quotes.

**CONSTRUCTION CHANGE ORDERS (10/13/16)**

Pursuant to Cleveland Metroparks By-Laws, Article 5 (Procurement), Section 4 (b) and (c), as revised and approved by the Board of Park Commissioners on January 10, 2013, "...the CEO is not authorized to enter into any change orders to construction contracts, without prior approval of the Board in each instance, except that the CEO is authorized to enter into change orders to construction contracts, without prior approval of the Board in each instance, where the additional cost is less than THE LESSER OF: (i) \$50,000, or (ii) ten percent (10%) of the cost of the contract. Each change order by the CEO under this Article shall be reported to the Board at the next meeting of the Board following the execution of said change order."

(c). "Amendment to Professional Service Contract. For professional service contracts greater than \$50,000, the CEO is not authorized to enter into any amendment to professional services or other special services agreement, without prior approval of the Board in each instance, except that the CEO is authorized to enter into amendments to professional services and other special services agreements for additional fees, without prior approval by the Board in each instance, where the additional fees for the agreement by the CEO pursuant to this Section, aggregate less than THE LESSER OF: (i) \$50,000, or (ii) ten percent (10%) of the cost of the agreement. Each amendment by the CEO under this Section shall be reported to the Board at the next meeting of the Board following the execution of said amendment.", the following is provided:

<b><u>Contract</u></b>	<b><u>Item/Service</u></b>	<b><u>Vendor</u></b>	<b><u>Change Order No.</u></b>
<b><u>Windows at Lakefront Office</u></b> <b>\$45,700.00</b>  Revised Contract Amount: Change order #1 Added \$4,232.00  Total revised to \$49,932.00	Supply and install steel posts, new door with trim and frost slab.	SRK Enterprise, Inc.	Change Order No. 1
<b><u>2016 Parkside Roofing</u></b> <b>\$71,791.13</b>  Revised Contract Amount: Change order #2 Added \$4,300.00  Total revised to \$76,091.13	Siding replacement, gutter repair, wall flashing at roof repair.	Absolute Roofing	Change Order No. 2
<b><u>Wilson's Landing Phase II</u></b> <b>\$30,120.00</b>  Revised Contract Amount: Change order #1 Added \$1,055.00  Total revised to \$31,175.00	Final improvements including additional shower tile repair.	Schirmer Construction, LLC	Change Order No. 1

**INFORMATION/BRIEFING ITEMS/POLICY.**

- a. ***Chief Executive Officer's Employee Guests***  
(Originating Source: Brian M. Zimmerman, Chief Executive Officer)

**Sir-Keith Bush, Food & Beverage Generalist – Golf Operations**

Sir-Keith Bush began his career with Cleveland Metroparks in May of 2014 when he was hired as a seasonal employee in the Golf Division. Through his hard work and dedication, Keith remained with Cleveland Metroparks and has become a tremendous asset to the General Manager of Restaurant & Food Services and the entire Golf team. Keith has a very positive attitude and has volunteered to work special events including Edgewater Live, Sandcastles, 4 Miles, and Shawnee Hills/Seneca golf events. Keith excelled at being a server during Friday Fish Fry's at Big Met Golf Course. He has an infectious personality that is enjoyed by management staff and co-workers, many of whom he assisted with training. Keith is ServSafe certified. His career has taken him from a seasonal, to a variable, to a part-time, and to a recently promoted full-time employee. Keith is a true success story and one of the many true assets of Cleveland Metroparks.

**Benjamin Smith, Chef – Golf Operations**

Ben Smith has been with Cleveland Metroparks since February of 2016 when he joined the staff of Golf Operations as a Chef. Ben brought to his position more than eight years' experience in upper management while being employed at Plumbrook Country Club in Sandusky, Ohio. While at Plumbrook, he spent five years as a Sous Chef and approximately four years as an Executive Chef. He became accomplished in the areas of concession, banquet and fine dining services, all of which experience brings value to his current position. Ben has more than 15 years working in the restaurant industry having been employed at several restaurants in both Seattle, Washington and San Diego, California. He is also knowledgeable in labor and food costs budgeting and is ServSafe certified.

- b. ***Euclid Creek Greenway – Euclid Central Middle School Property***  
(Originating Sources: Brian M. Zimmerman, Chief Executive Officer/Sean E. McDermott, P.E., Chief Planning and Design Officer/Sara Byrnes Maier, Senior Strategic Park Planner)

A review of archived records conducted as part of planning work on the Euclid Creek Greenway, a proposed connector trail between the lower Euclid Creek Reservation and its lakefront portion, showed that a 5.4-acre parcel that is part of the 17.0-acre site of the Euclid Central Middle School had originally been part of the Euclid Creek Reservation and was sold to the Euclid City School District in 1965 for \$112,500. The language in the deed states, "said land shall be used for public school purposes only, and if such use of said land is abandoned for such purposes, or if said land ceases to be used for such purposes, or is used for any other purpose, then title, possession and ownership of said land shall revert back to... Cleveland Metroparks."

**INFORMATION/BRIEFING ITEMS/POLICY (cont.)**

The Euclid City Schools have placed a bond issue on the November 2016 ballot seeking to pursue a second phase of school consolidation, which would include building a new middle school on a combined campus with the high school. Should the \$96.3 million bond issue succeed, the Central Middle School site would no longer be needed by the school district and would be abated and demolished through an allowance from the bond package. At the request of the Euclid City Schools Superintendent, Dr. Charles Smialek, Cleveland Metroparks provided the conceptual rendering shown on page **82451** to illustrate how the site may look should the bond issue pass and the site be redeveloped for passive recreation.

Cleveland Metroparks staff will provide background to the Board and remain in contact with the Euclid City School District about the bond issue and Central Middle School property. An update will be provided to the Board in November following the election.

**c. *Development of a Rare Features Database***

*(Originating Sources: Sean E. McDermott, P.E., Chief Planning and Design Officer/ Stephen Mather, GIS Manager/Terry Robison, Director of Natural Resources)*

Cleveland Metroparks is an integral part of Cleveland and Northeast Ohio's regional identity. Founded in 1917, Cleveland Metroparks was the first natural-area park district in Ohio. The system was at the forefront of the national movement to preserve areas of natural beauty for public enjoyment and improved quality of life. Cleveland Metroparks mission includes the protection of natural resources found within its boundaries. In highly developed Cuyahoga County, Cleveland Metroparks is the repository of most of the unmodified natural features and species native to this area. Increasing development, encroachment, invasion by exotic species and factors beyond human control increase the vulnerability of plants, animals and other organisms and natural features placed under our protection.

Lists and locations of rare and common species and other natural features have been informally kept since the establishment of the organization. Records were also kept by the Cleveland Museum of Natural History and other local institutions, but to this moment there has not been a single, comprehensive repository for this information. The lack of such a centralized system has posed significant challenges in the past.

Staff will provide an update to the Board as preparations are being made to obtain quotes for a firm to assist staff in the development of a web based database of natural features.

**AWARD OF BIDS; CONSTRUCTION CHANGE ORDERS; STATUS RE: CAPITAL PROJECTS.**

The following were presented to the Board for award/acknowledgment: bid tabulations, as shown on pages **82437** through **82442**; \$10,000 to \$50,000 purchased items/services report, pages **82443** through **82445**; and construction change orders, page **82446**.

**APPROVAL OF VOUCHERS AND PAYROLL.**

**No. 16-10-161:** It was moved by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, to approve payroll and vouchers, employee withholding taxes, and ADP payroll, as identified on pages **82452** to **82525**.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.

Nays: None.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS.**

Ms. Marty Lesher of Olmsted Township read from a prepared statement. Ms. Lesher's comments can be heard in their entirety by accessing the "About Us" section of Cleveland Metroparks website under "Board Meetings/Board Meeting Archives."

Comments were also made by members of the Board, the Chief Executive Officer, and the Chief Legal & Ethics Officer. Specific comments were made in acknowledgement of the contributions of the Board and all staff in recently receiving the fourth Gold Medal Award for Cleveland Metroparks. All such comments can be heard entirely by accessing the "About Us" section of Cleveland Metroparks website under "Board Meetings/Board Meeting Archives."

**DATE OF NEXT MEETING.**

The next Regular Meeting of the Board of Park Commissioners was scheduled by the Board for Thursday, October 27, 2016, 8:00 a.m. at the Board's office, 4101 Fulton Parkway, Cleveland, Ohio.

**ADJOURNMENT TO EXECUTIVE SESSION.**

**No. 16-10-168:** At 9:10 a.m., upon motion by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker and carried, the meeting adjourned to an Executive Session for the purpose of discussing a Personnel (Employment) Matter, Pending Litigation, and Collective Bargaining, as stated by Chief Legal and Ethics Officer, Rose Fini.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Aye: Ms. Berry  
Aye: Mr. Rinker  
Aye: Mr. Moore  
Nays: None.

**No action was taken as a result of the Executive Session.**

**ADJOURNMENT.**

**No. 16-10-169:** There being no further matters to come before the Board, upon motion by Vice President Moore, seconded by Vice President Rinker, and carried, President Berry adjourned the meeting at 10:00 a.m.

Vote on the motion was as follows:

Ayes: Ms. Berry, Messrs. Moore and Rinker.  
Nays: None.

---

President.

Attest:

---

Secretary.

Norfolk and Western  
Railroad

Euclid Creek

All Purpose Trail

All Purpose Trail

Playground

Entry Drive

Euclid Creek Reservation



# Conceptual Euclid Creek Greenway Connector- Euclid Central Middle School Site

Cleveland Metroparks



**RESOLUTION NO. 16-10-161**

The following vouchers have been reviewed as to legality of expenditure and conformity with the Ohio Revised Code.

Attest: \_\_\_\_\_  
Chief Financial Officer

BE IT RESOLVED, that the following **Checks** dated September 21, 2016 in the amount of \$68,918.77; and **Checks** dated September 23, 2016 in the amount of \$557,299.61; and **Checks** dated September 28, 2016 in the amount of \$332,605.74; and **Checks** dated October 7, 2016 in the amount of \$538,349.87; and **Checks** dated October 13, 2016 in the amount of \$2,058,179.73; and **“Then and Now Certificates”** including **Visa Purchasing Card** purchases dated September 11, 2016 to October 1, 2016 in the amount of \$260,610.07; and **Visa Travel Card** purchases dated September 11, 2016 to October 1, 2016 in the amount of \$24,892.96; and **Manual Check** M000652 dated October 13, 2016 in the amount of \$2,545.50 payable to Surety Title Agency, Inc.; and **Purchases**, including but not limited to purchases of \$1,000.00 or more, as listed on the voucher summary for which certification of funds was not obtained before the purchase, be approved.

PASSED: October 13, 2016

Attest: \_\_\_\_\_  
President of the Board of Park Commissioners  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Chief Executive Officer

**VOUCHER SUMMARY**

	No. of Vendors	No. of Purchases	Average Vendor Amount		Average Purchase Amount	Code
Bid Items	38	167	\$ 1,125,005.07	\$ 29,605.40	\$ 6,736.56	C Bid Items
Board Authorized Payments	37	215	\$ 380,345.61	\$ 10,279.61	\$ 1,769.05	A Board Authorized Payments
Director Approved Payments	53	185	\$ 308,362.74	\$ 5,818.16	\$ 1,666.83	D Director Approved Payments
Telephone-Written Quote Items	23	45	\$ 84,584.41	\$ 3,677.58	\$ 1,879.65	P Telephone-Written Quote Items
Telephone Quote Items	48	103	\$ 106,048.84	\$ 2,209.35	\$ 1,029.60	T Telephone Quote Items
Utilities	26	240	\$ 229,202.14	\$ 8,815.47	\$ 955.01	U Utilities
Health Insurance	3	10	\$ 151,171.91	\$ 50,390.64	\$ 15,117.19	H Health Insurance
Other Exempt Items	78	89	\$ 1,121,919.39	\$ 14,383.58	\$ 12,605.84	E Other Exempt Items
Non-Bid Items less than \$1,000	66	108	\$ 26,496.47	\$ 401.46	\$ 245.34	N Non-Bid Items less than \$1,000
Purchases Obtained w/o Cert.	4	6	\$ 22,217.14	\$ 5,554.29	\$ 3,702.86	S Purchases Obtained w/o Cert.
	<b>376</b>	<b>1168</b>	<b>\$ 3,555,353.72</b>	<b>\$ 9,455.73</b>	<b>\$ 3,043.97</b>	

- N - Purchases less than \$1,000 for vendors who do not accept a credit card; purchase order is printed
- T - Telephone quoted items from \$1,000 to \$5,000 (Various vendors of our choice are contacted to provide a verbal quotation on a specific item. A minimum of three phone quotes are observed.)
- P - Telephone quoted items from \$5,001 to \$10,000 (The lowest of three phone quotes must submit a written quote.)
- D - Items from \$10,001 to \$50,000 approved by Chief Executive Officer including Article XII purchases.
- E - Exempt items - (Taxes, assessments, credit card payments and permit fees which require timely payments, employee reimbursements, prisoner housing, court costs, refunds, petty cash, special purchase account, land acquisition expense up to \$5,000 to secure closing transactions and legal obligations of the board.)
- C - A complete descriptive bid specification is developed, advertised for public notice and awarded to the lowest and/or best bidder including Article XII purchases.
- A - Board authorized payments.
- U - Utilities
- H - Health insurance purchase in accordance with our negotiated bargaining agreements and other employee/group insurance premiums.
- S - Purchases obtained without certifications of funds.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

That The Board of Park Commissioners approves **Resolution No. 16-10-161** listed above.